9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

BEFORE THE STATE OF WASHINGTON ENERGY FACILITY SITING EVALUATION COUNCIL

In the Matter of the Application of:

Scout Clean Energy, LLC, for Horse Heaven Wind Farm, LLC, Applicant.

DOCKET NO. EF-210011

INTERVENOR TRI-CITIES C.A.R.E.S MOTION TO COMPEL ATTENDANCE OF SENIOR PROJECT MANAGER DAVID KOBUS AT A DEPOSITION AND FOR SANCTIONS

I. INTRODUCTION.

Following the authorization of the Presiding Administrative Law Judge (PALJ) Torem on May 19, 2023, Intervenor Tri-Cities C.A.R.E.S (TCC) filed a notice to take the deposition of David (Dave) Kobus, Applicant's Senior Project Manager for the Horse Heaven Wind Project (the "wind project"). Since that time, Applicant has steadfastly refused to produce Mr. Kobus for his deposition, without moving for a protective order. The Applicant claims that TCC's counsel may ask questions that are not relevant to the proceedings. This refusal is without a basis in law, either within the Civil Rules, APA practice or the rulings in this proceeding.

The PALJ should order Mr. Kobus to appear for his deposition on a shortened time frame and award TCC terms and sanctions for its improper refusal to make this key witness available for deposition.

INTERVENOR TRI-CITIES C.A.R.E.S MOTION TO COMPEL ATTENDANCE OF SENIOR PROJECT MANAGER DAVID KOBUS AT A DEPOSITION AND FOR SANCTIONS - 1

22 23

24

25

26

27 28

II. MOTION.

Intervenor TCC moves the PALJ for an order compelling the attendance of Mr. David Kobus, the Senior Project Manager for this project, at a deposition on an expedited basis. Because of the improper refusal of the applicant to respond to authorized discovery, the PALJ should award sanctions to TCC, including 1) a reasonable time to utilize the deposition testimony in hearing preparation and 2) monetary sanctions based on the additional cost incurred by TCC because of the improper refusals of the Applicant.¹

III. FACTUAL BACKGROUND.

3.1 THE PROJECT AND PROJECT MANAGER.

On February 8, 2021, Scout Clean Energy filed with EFSEC its Application for Site Certification (ASC) for the Horse Heaven Wind Farm (the Project), applying to EFSEC for approval of a wind, solar and storage project. Paragraph 1.4 of the ASC (page 1-2) states that: "All communications concerning this ASC should be directed to Mr. Dave Kobus, who is the designated agent for the Project[.]" Press releases and newspaper accounts from the Applicant indicate that Mr. Kobus has been associated with this project at least since September 5, 2020. See **Exhibit A** to the Declaration of J. Richard Aramburu in Support of Motion to Compel Deposition (hereinafter Aramburu Decl.)

The cover letter from Scout to EFSEC accompanying the ASC stated that if EFSEC staff had "any questions, or require further information, please contact Dave Kobus. . ." See the Application for the Horse Heaven Application the EFSEC webste.

The SEPA environmental checklist at Paragraph 3 identified Mr. Kobus in

¹ This motion is directed to the Presiding Administrative Law Judge. TCC has filed a motion to recuse the assigned ALJ Adam Torem dated May 25, 2023 and a ruling on the motion was received on June 23, denying the request. TCC stands by its motion for recusal and this motion does not waive any rights regarding the recusal request directed to the currently assigned ALJ, Mr. Torem.

response to the "Address and phone number of applicant and contact person." 2

On the applicant's website, in a section titled "Meet Dave Kobus: Senior Project Manager with Horse Heaven Clean Energy Center," he is described as follows:

When the opportunity to lead the development of Horse Heaven Clean Energy Center (HHCEC) arose, Dave did not hesitate to join. With deep knowledge of the existing energy infrastructure in the region, combined with his passion for contributing positively to his community, HHCEC was a perfect fit.

In his role with HHCEC, Dave builds teams of consultants who can provide top level expertise for each aspect of the project. He evaluates what consultants are preparing, does his research and asks any questions needed to fill in the full picture of the project. He notes that very few people in the energy industry have expertise in all aspects of the industry, so it is vitally important to build teams of experts who can go deep on specific subjects. While rare to find someone who knows it all, Dave prepares himself with up-to-date information on the status of everything related to the HHCEC development.

"As the region grows, we will need more energy supply. And it takes a diverse mix of technology to be able to create that reliable and robust supply," said Dave. "It took me a long time to grasp how energy sources and supply are interrelated, so I understand where people are coming from when they have questions. It's really important to me that I am able to explain this project to anyone, and to demonstrate how exciting this project really is."

Italics in original; underline supplied.³ The amended and updated ASC filed in December, 2022 continued to list Mr. Kobus as the designated agent for the Project. See EFSEC Horse Heaven project website.

Indeed, Mr. Kobus is listed in the Amended ASC as a participant in all variety of project issues, including a Biological Survey Review (page 1-29), project blogs (page 1-59), emails with the Yakama nation and cultural studies (page 1-63, 1-66,1-67, 1-69, 1-74. 1-77, 1-79), the Benton County Road system (page 1-63), DNR consultation (page 1-69), ethnobotanical survey (1-78, 1-79, 1-81), visual impacts and tower locations (page 1-87, 1-88, 1-90, 1-91).

² The Environmental Checklist is included on the EFSEC website.

³ Source:

https://horseheavencleanenergy.com/meet-dave-kobus-senior-project-manager-with-horse-heaven-clean-energy-center/. This entry in the website is **Exhibit B** to the Aramburu Decl.

18 19

17

20

21

22

23

24

25

27

28

26

Further, neither the original nor amended SCA were signed by any representative of the Applicant, and neither SCA included any listing of the authors of the document. As described on page 2 above, Mr. Kobus is the only witness that is identified (by the Applicant) as having "up to date information on the status of everything related to the HHCEC development."

3.2 REQUESTS TO TAKE KOBUS DEPOSITION.

Based on requests made by the parties, especially at the third prehearing conference held on May 2, 2023, the PALJ ruled in Prehearing Order No. 2 (PHO#2) (May 19, 2023) that discovery pursuant to the APA and EFSEC Rules (WAC 463-30-190) would be authorized. See page 2. The PALJ specifically authorized use of Washington's Superior Court Rules 26-37, modifying them only to determine their use "will be subject to expedited response time of no more than 10 business days." Accordingly, TCC sought a deposition of Mr. Kobus promptly. However, TCC then met with the continuous refusal of the Applicant to make their Project Manager available for deposition. Below is a timetable of TCC's efforts to schedule this deposition.

- 3.2.1. On May 26, 2023, TCC provided notice of taking Mr. Kobus's deposition to Scout and other parties; the deposition was noted for June 5, 2023. See **Exhibit C** to Aramburu Decl. As the managing agent of Scout, a notice of deposition is sufficient to compel his attendance. CR 30(b)(1). A deposition date of June 5 was selected because the results of the deposition could be used as a part of TCC's filings for the first round of testimony, due June 12.
- 3.2.2. On May 30, 2023, counsel for Scout wrote a letter to the PALJ indicating that Mr. Kobus was on vacation and would not appear on June 5, 2023. The Applicant's letter also objected to the deposition of Mr. Kobus, but did not file a motion for protective order.
 - 3.2.3. In addition, in objection when no confirmation of Mr. Kobus's

attendance at the June 5 deposition was received, counsel for TCC indicated it would file a motion to compel Mr. Kobus to attend his deposition if he did not appear.

- 3.2.4. On June 2, 2023, the PALJ responded to the May 30 letter written by Mr. McMahon.⁴ In his letter, the PALJ noted that there was no need for advance permission from the presiding ALJ to note a deposition. This letter is found in the Adjudication folder on the EFSEC website.
- 3.2.5. On June 15, 2023, following the filing of TCC's direct testion, counsel for TCC sent an email to counsel for the Applicant to reschedule the deposition of Mr. Kobus for 10 am on June 22, 2023, when he presumably had returned from vacation. An alternate deposition date of Friday, June 23, 2023 was also offered. See **Exhibit D** to Aramburu Decl.
- 3.2.6. On June 15, 2023, counsel for Scout responded to TCC's June 15, 2023 letter, asking TCC to limit the scope of its deposition to specific questions but again refusing to make Mr. Kobus available for deposition. Again no protective order was sought.
- 3.2.7. On June 16, 2023, counsel for TCC responded to the Applicants' June 15 email acknowledging the "disputed issues for adjudication" and that Benton County and TCC were fully communicating and cooperating. See **Exhibit E** to Aramburu Decl. TCC counsel also indicated that further delay and unwarranted interference with TCC's right to engage in discovery were entirely inappropriate, and if the Applicant continued to refuse to make Mr. Kobus available we would seek an order to compel his attendance.
- 3.2.8. On June 18, 2023, counsel for the Applicant continued its obstinate refusal to make Mr. Kobus available for deposition, saying he would not

⁴ In EFSEC practice, discovery materials are not filed in the administrative record as the PALJ acknowledged in his letter.

19 20

21 22

23

24 25

26

27

28

appear unless the parties would "agree in advance to limit the scope of the deposition to the fairly narrow range of issues that Judge Torem has identified. . . . " Counsel acknowledged that TCC may need to file a motion. See Exhibit F to the Aramburu Decl.

3.2.9. On June 19, 2023, counsel for TCC responded to the June 18 email from Scout's counsel, pointing out that PHO#2 indicated that approved issues would be "broadly construed" and again requesting that Mr. Kobus be made available for testimony on June 22.

3.2.10. On June 23, 2023, counsel for Scout proposed a phone call "next week" to discuss the permissible scope of questions. See Exhibit G to Aramburu Dec.

3.2.11. On June 23, 2023, counsel for TCC indicated its intention to file this motion to compel, but stated it would review proposals for a limited scope of questioning if promptly received. Exhibit G.

LEGAL AUTHORITY: OTHER THAN TO DELAY TCC, NO JUSTIFIABLE 4. REASON EXISTS FOR REFUSING TO MAKE MR. KOBUS AVAILABLE FOR A DEPOSITION.

Generally, a party may use any variety or type of discovery allowed by the Civil Rules. See CR 26(a). The court will step in only if the discovery is "unreasonably cumulative or duplicative," if "other means of discovery are otherwise available" or if the discovery is "unduly burdensome or expensive," taking into account the importance of the issues at stake in the litigation." *Id.* Regarding whether the deposition of Mr. Kobus would be "unduly burdensome or expensive" to the Applicant, the Applicant itself represents in the Amended ASC that it is a "portfolio company of Brookfield Renewable" which is in turn described as follows:

Brookfield Renewable operates one of the world's largest publicly traded, pure-play renewable power platforms. Its portfolio consists of hydroelectric, wind, solar and storage facilities in North America, South America, Europe and Asia, and totals approximately 24,000 MW of installed capacity and an approximately 100,000 MW development pipeline. Brookfield Renewable is the flagship listed renewable power company of Brookfield Asset Management, a leading global alternative asset manager with approximately \$750 billion of assets under management.

INTERVENOR TRI-CITIES C.A.R.E.S MOTION TO COMPEL ATTENDANCE OF SENIOR PROJECT MANAGER DAVID KOBUS AT A DEPOSITION AND FOR SANCTIONS - 6

J. RICHARD ARAMBURU, PLLC 7052^M AVE., SUITE 1300 SEATTLE 98104 Telephone (206) 625-9515 FAX (206) 682-1376 aramburulaw.com

Amended ASC at 1-1. In contrast, TCC is a private public interest organization that represents many local interests, has no financial or equity interest in the project and it is not a competitor to Brookfield, As the PALJ is aware, this is an extraordinary project, which the Applicant claims will cost \$1,727,000,000 (\$1.7 Billion). ASC at Paragraph 2.3.14 (page 2-85). Physically, the project will extend over 25 miles of landscapes and ridge lines in Benton County.

In short, there is no basis to restrict the discovery right of a small, nonprofit, public interest corporation which is the only intervenor representing the interests of the public in this matter. Mr. Kobus is certainly touted as having extensive testamentary knowledge concerning the Project; indeed he is offered by the applicant as the most knowledgeable person on the Scout staff: "Dave prepares himself with up-to-date information on the status of everything related to the HHCEC development."⁵

Without any basis of any kind, the applicant claims "the purpose of this requested deposition is to unduly burden Applicant and harass Mr. Kobus by diving into information that is neither relevant nor material to these proceedings and in no way related to the defined issues." See Applicant's May 30 letter to ALJ Torem. However the Applicant itself has quoted Mr. Kobus as an aggressive spokesman for the project:

It's really important to me that I am able to explain this project to anyone, and to demonstrate how exciting this project really is.

Id. Apparently, "anyone" does not include counsel for the public interest intervenor.

Counsel for Scout participated in PHC#3 on May 2, 2023, at which discovery was discussed, and did not propose any "guardrails" that might be established regarding deposition testimony. When PHO#2 was issued, it contained lists of permitted and prohibited issues, which came with the following guidance from the PALJ:

⁵ See the Scout Website, Exhibit B to the Aramburu Decl..

The scope and intent of these approved issues will be broadly construed to allow parties to present their individual cases for and against the project, subject to motions to strike irrelevant evidence or witness testimony that is clearly outside the scope of EFSEC's review process.

The Applicant did not file an objection to this treatment of issues, to the section on "Discovery" or ask that additional restrictions ("guardrails") be placed on issue discussion or the discovery mechanisms. It is far too late for the Applicant to make additional objections on the relevancy of issues or discovery mechanisms based on vague general grounds. Counsel for TCC has repeatedly confirmed that it will keep within the guidance in PHO#2.

Moreover, the Applicant has not moved for a protective order, which is required before a party can withhold a witness from discovery. Indeed, the Applicant advertises Mr. Kobus as "Mr. Know-It-All."⁶

As noted in *Physicians Ins. Exch. v Fisons Corp.*, 122 Wn 2d 299, 353-54, 858 P.2d 1054 (1993):

The rules are clear that a party must fully answer all interrogatories and all requests for production, unless a specific and clear objection is made. If the drug company did not agree with the scope of production or did not want to respond, then it was required to move for a protective order. In this case, the documents requested were relevant. The drug company did not have the option of determining what it would produce or answer, once discovery requests were made. 89

Footnote 89 stated, in part:

Taylor v. Cessna Aircraft Co., 39 Wn. App. 828, 836, 696 P.2d 28 (defendant and its counsel could not unilaterally decide what was relevant in a particular case, defendant's remedy was to seek a protective order, not to withhold discoverable material), review denied, 103 Wn.2d 1040 (1985).

As described above, more recently, on June 20, 2023 Scout's counsel said:

If you'll submit the questions you'd like to ask Mr. Kobus, we'll undertake to have Mr. Kobus answer them in good faith, in writing and under oath, subject to the objections we're raising as to scope.

As noted above, it is counsel for a party seeking discovery that decides the methods

⁶ See Exhibit B to Aramburu Decl.

and extent of use of discovery subject to limitations above; a party <u>defending</u> discovery does not get to set the manner of discovery. But Scout now wants to dictate to TCC how it should conduct discovery, apparently requiring TCC to submit interrogatories under Rule 33 rather than a deposition under Rule 30. Of course, that process will essentially allow Scout lawyers to fashion responses to interrogatories, while in a deposition, an "attorney shall not privately confer with deponents during the deposition between a question and an answer except for determining the existence of privilege." CR 30(h)(5).

There is an additional factor here. The applicant has filed a 644-page Updated Application for Site Certification, but it is not signed by the applicant. Nor is there any list of authors who are responsible for the content of the application. The Applicant's Opening Testimony does not even contain a list of authors. The only representative of the applicant that is identified as knowledgeable about the application is Mr. Kobus.

The unwarranted refusal of the Applicant to make its Project Manager available, self-described by the Applicant as Mr. "Know-It-All," supports the granting of an order requiring his immediate availability for a deposition.

V. REQUEST FOR SANCTIONS.

As described above, TCC has had to respond to the frivolous refusals of the Applicant to make his project manager available for deposition. The Applicant continuous refused to produce its long time project manager claiming the need to refine issues, when these issues were established by PHO#2, though no mention of the need to further refine issues was made during the prehearing process and no objection to PHO#2 was filed. In any event, concerns about individual questions are resolved during the deposition by objection to questions or by motions to strike.

The Applicant, a \$750B company, was well aware of the highly compressed schedule for these hearings, but continuously refused to make Mr. Kobus available for

INTERVENOR TRI-CITIES C.A.R.E.S MOTION TO COMPEL ATTENDANCE OF SENIOR PROJECT MANAGER DAVID KOBUS AT A DEPOSITION AND FOR SANCTIONS - 10

his deposition to prevent use of his testimony in adjudicative hearings. These delays were clear violations of the terms and spirit of PHO#2 and the more traditional Civil Rules for discovery at CR 26-37. This has created two specific types of injury to TCC. First, TCC has been delayed for over a month from obtaining and using the Kobus deposition to prepare testimony or as a resource for testimony of other TCC witnesses. Second, it has put TCC, a community organization to substantial expense to deal with applicant's repetitive objections and to draft this motion.

Unless the frivolous actions of the Applicant are sanctioned, it will continue to create delay and expense for the other parties to these proceedings. Given the circumstances, the PALJ should grant sanctions to TCC for the frivolous and unwarranted refusal to comply with standard discovery requests.

The rule requiring sanction for discovery violations is well established.

Like CR 11, CR 26(g) makes the imposition of sanctions mandatory, if a violation of the rule is found. Sanctions are warranted in this case. What the sanctions should be and against whom they should be imposed is a question that cannot be fairly answered without further factual inquiry, and that is the trial court's function. While we recognize that the issue of imposition of sanctions upon attorneys is a difficult and disagreeable task for a trial judge, it is a necessary one if our system is to remain accessible and responsible.

Physicians Ins. Exch. v Fisons Corp., 122 Wn.2d 299, 355 (1993).

Appropriate sanctions for the frivolous failure of the Applicant to make its managing agent available for deposition are as follows. First, that TCC should be granted a reasonable time after the deposition is taken, and transcribed, to submit the deposition as testimony or allow its use by other witnesses for TCC, without regard to the existing adjudication schedule. TCC requests that it be given three full weeks after the deposition is signed by the witness (Mr. Kobus) per CR 30(e) to submit testimony based on the content of the deposition. No rebuttal should be allowed by Applicant to this material unless it falls within the deadline for the submission by PHO#2 or amendments thereto.

J. RICHARD ARAMBURU, PLLC 705 2ND AVE., SUITE 1300 SEATTLE 98104 Telephone (206) 625-9515 FAX (206) 682-1376

Second, the PALJ should award monetary sanctions in the amount of \$2,400 to TCC as attorney fees incurred as a result of the improper and frivolous failure to make Mr. Kobus available for his deposition. These fees are itemized in the attached Declaration of J. Richard Aramburu In Support of Motion to Compel.

VI. CONCLUSION.

The refusal of the Applicant to make its "know-it-all" project manager available for deposition, without filing a protective order, is inconsistent with PHO#2 and the Civil Rules, especially based on the Applicant statements to the public of Mr. Kobus's accessibility: "It's really important to me that I am able to explain this project to anyone." In light of clear violation of the rules, the motion to compel should be granted.

In addition, because the violation was willful and deliberate, sanctions should be entered against the Applicant as follows. First, TCC should be permitted to file testimony based on the deposition of Mr. Kobus within three weeks of the signing of his deposition, without regard to the current schedule for submission of testimony. Second, TCC should be granted \$2,400 in sanctions based upon the fees incurred based on the actions of the applicant.

Respectfully submitted this 25th day of June, 2023.

/s/

J. Richard Aramburu, WSBA #466 Attorney for Tri-Cities C.A.R.E.S.

The Commercial Review

Portland, Indiana 47371

www.thecr.com

Dueling realities highlight week

By STEVE PEOPLES

AP National Political Writer
NEW YORK — On the campaign trail with President Donald Trump, the pandemic is largely over, the economy is roaring back and murderous mobs are infiltrating America's suburbs.

With Democrat Biden, the pandemic is raging, the economy isn't lifting the working class and systemic racism threatens Black lives across America.

The first week of the fall sprint to Election Day crystallized dizzyingly different versions of reality as the Republican incumbent and his Democratic challenger trekked from Washington and Delaware to Wisconsin and Pennsylvania and back, each man on an urgent mission to sell his particular message to anxious voters.

All the conflicting messages carry at least a sliver of truth, some much more than others, as the candidates fight to navigate one of the most turbulent election seasons in modern history. And beyond legitimate crises threatening public health, the economy and public safety, a new divide erupted Friday over the military.

aggressively Trump denied allegations reported late Thursday that in 2018, he described U.S. service members killed in World War I and buried at an American military cemetery in France as "losers" and "suckers." The report, sourced anonymously by The Atlantic and largely confirmed by The Associated Press, comes as Trump tries to win support from military members and their families by highlighting a commitment to veterans' health care and mili-

tary spending. "I've done more for the military than almost anyone else," Trump said Friday from the Oval Office, after describing the allegations on social media as "a disgraceful attempt to influence the 2020 Elec-

See **Dueling** page 2

Getting Bizy



Long is opening coffee shop and bakery Tuesday in John Jay Center for Learning

By BAILEY CLINE

The Commercial Review Hannah Long started baking with her mom, Kim McAbee, when she was a child. She treasures her memories of baking cinnamon rolls together

Bizy Dips business

enjoys

owner Hannah Long

baking cinnamon rolls

because she loves the

smell. Long will open

her new bakery and

coffee shop in the

John Jay Center for

Learning lobby on

she

said

Tuesday.

every Christmas Eve. As an adult, Long has become a talented baker, McAbee said.

"The baking comes so easy to her," she ly announced plans to explained, noting that open a central location. she tends to follow Almost eight year recipes to-the-book while her daughter can successfully throw a recipe together. "She's not afraid to try (new things). Hers is always much better than mine."

When Long got mar-ried in 2012, she began ceremony and soft open-goods than coffee?" streets in Portland. Her father built the cottage strawberries for Valentine's Day. As her straw-berries gained populari-ty, she started selling them and other baked goods at the Portland Farmers Market. Now she sells out of stock at the market nearly every Saturday, and she recent-

Learning lobby at 101 S. because she loves coffee

selling chocolate-covered ing Friday, the new business will open to the public Tuesday.

Long said she's excited to open her shop in the facility in part because of its centralized loca-

"We're really just right at the heart of Portland," she said.

ular items like cinnamon as well as flavored sodas Almost eight years rolls and chocolate-cov- and hot chocolate for after her strawberry suc- ered strawberries. She cess, Long is opening her will also sell muffins, own bakery and coffee shop, Bizy Dips, in the goods. She decided to add John Jay Center for coffee to her shop menu

Her drink menu will include a full lineup of expresso drinks, lattes, cappuccinos, cold brew and regular coffee. She plans to theme different drinks after bakery items, like a chocolatebakery strawberry covered mocha or a blueberry crumble latte. She will Long plans to sell pop- also sell iced and hot tea non-coffee drinkers.

For now, Long will continue baking her goods job lost some business in her kitchen at the during the COVID-19 Prayer Cottage, a house located at the corner of Meridian St., Portland. and, as she said, "what Pleasant and Middle

for their family to use as a meeting place, and it's also used for Bible studies and traveling missionaries. She hopes to add an oven and baking area at John Jay so visitors can smell the fresh treats when they walk inside.

Long plans to rope her husband, Patrick, into some barista training. Patrick explained that while his home-based recruitment marketing shutdown, his wife's bakery was booming.

See Bizy page 5



The Commercial Review/Bailey Cline

Wabash way

Fort Recovery middle school Wabash tribe members react to trivia answers during Indian Way Day Friday on the high school football field. The Wabash tribe won the Fort Recovery trivia contest that afternoon.

Officer agrees to plead guilty

SOUTH BEND, Ind. (AP) - A in March after finding that he white former South Bend police was justified in the unrelated officer whose fatal shooting of a Black man last year roiled then-Mayor Pete Buttigieg's presidential campaign has agreed to plead guilty to a felony charge stemming from an alleged onduty sexual encounter he had a month before that shooting.

A plea agreement filed Wednesday calls for Ryan O'Neill to plead guilty to a ghost employment count, while prosecutors would drop a felony charge of official misconduct and a misdemeanor public indecency charge, the South Bend Tribune report-

A probable cause affidavit filed in March with the sexualencounter charges states that O'Neill was in his police cruiser, in uniform, on May 16, 2019, when he pulled up next to a woman and solicited her for a sex act. O'Neill paid her \$20 before that sex act, it states.

A special prosecutor filed those charges against O'Neill, 44, force is pending.

fatal June 16, 2019, shooting of Eric Logan. O'Neill had said he shot Logan, 54, after he refused his orders to drop a knife while O'Neill was investigating a report of a person breaking into cars.

The special prosecutor, Ric Hertel, said during a March news conference that evidence showed Logan approached O'Neill with a knife and the officer feared for his safety when he fired two shots, one of which struck Logan in the upper abdomen.

O'Neill resigned weeks after the shooting. The fallout from Logan's killing presented Buttigieg with some of the toughest moments of his bid to win the Democratic nomination for president.

A federal lawsuit that Logan's family filed against O'Neill and the city of South Bend accusing O'Neill of using excessive deadly

Weather

Jay County had a high temperature of 77 degrees Friday.

Skies will be mostly sunny today with a high of 80. The low will be 52.

Expect a high of 78 Sunday under mostly cloudy skies. The high on Labor Day will be 79 and thunderstorms are possible in the afternoon. Lows Sunday and Monday will be in the 60s. Tuesday's high will be 85.

See page 2 for an extended outlook.

In review

The Commercial Review office will be closed Monday in observance of the Labor Day holiday. We will reopen for regular business hours — 8 a.m. to 4 p.m. — on Tuesday.

Coming up

Tuesday — Results from today's JCHS football game at Seeger.

Wednesday — Coverage of Tuesday's Portland City Council meeting.



Wells launches new tourism site

Wells County has launched a new effort to attract visitors.

Wells County Chamber of Commerce and Economic Development launched a new website visitwellscounty.com recently following a study by Ball State University, The News

Banner (Bluffton) reported. The chamber's goal with the new site is to increase awareness of tourism opportunities such as events, places to eat and available lodging. Organizations hosting events will be able to upload information to the

"We are excited to offer a website for members of the community, as well as visitors, to have a central location to find information on events, activities and other things to do as they plan a trip through Wells County, Wells County Economic Development executive director Chad Kline said in a press release.

Clinic open

Adams Health Network has opened a free COVID-19 community testing clinic at the hospital's Physicians' Office Building, 815 High St., Decatur.

The effort is in partnership with Indiana Department of Health and Adams County Health Department.

The clinic will be open from 5 to 8 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8 a.m. to 4 p.m. Saturday and Sunday. Results are expected to take two to three days.

Development planned

Bruns Construction Enterprises is planning a residential and entertainment district on West Bank Road in Celina, The Daily Standard reported.

The project is planned for West Bank Road and would involve housing, a community pool and playground, and an entertainment are with a stage and deck adjacent to the recently renovated Boardwalk grill. There is also room for retail

The Daily Standard reported that construction on the first phase of the project could begin as early as this fall.

Partners honored

Three companies that are cushonored at the PACK Design Emergency Physicians.

Business roundup

Awards and the Wine Packaging Conference last month.

Ardagh, which operates glass manufacturing plants in Dunkirk and Winchester, makes bottles for Ken Wright Cellars, the secondplace finisher in the best luxury package design category.

A customized gift set by A X R Napa Valley took first place for best assorted set design and The Debate finished second in the same division. Both companies glass bottles are manufacture by Ardagh in the U.S.

"We celebrate these brands for their commitment to innovation and recognize them for being leaders in wine packaging design," said John T Shaddox, chief commercial officer for Ardagh's North American Glass business unit, in a press release.

Scout adding

Scout Clean Energy this week announced plans to add solar and battery storage components to a proposed wind farm in Benton County, Washington.

Scout, which is in the final stages of constructing Bitter Ridge Wind Farm in southwestern Jay County, has been working on development of the Washington facility since 2016. The wind farm is expected to produce 850 megawatts of combined wind, solar and batter power.

"Scout has been monitoring power market interest for solar and storage technology along with wind, referred to as a hybrid facility," said Scout project manager Dave Kobus in a press release. "Recent improvements in technology have created the economic conditions needed to support demand for co-locating a wind-solar-battery storage project in the Horse Heaven Hills.'

Lutheran honored

Lutheran Health Network's Dupont Hospital this week received Level 1 Geriatric Emergency Department Accreditation tomers of Ardagh Group were from the American College of

best practices for geriatric care. Level 1 is the most comprehensive designation.

"This particular patient population requires a higher level of specialized care," said Andrew Offerle, medical director of Dupont's emergency department. "We understand that many of our older patients have complicated

medical needs our processes tion to help r needs."

Bid revealed

NextEra En lion to purcha nity-owned el sewer utility Florida, the reported this v

NextEra, wh ates Bluff Po Center in sou and northern had filed suit vate, assertir Judicial Circu Norton on We ruling that the public record.

New design Burger King

restaurant des on new order options with first of them in

The sites wi or triple driveon-site orderir ery and pic advanced ord mobile app. Ti new designs is than traditio restaurants

"We took i how consume changing and want to intera rants," said F International officer Josh Ko a new design attractive to gu our franchise their return."

President n Walgreens H

week appointe president of W Standley propresident, CEO Rite Aid. He h Pathmark Stor

Drug Stores.

"John's leadership experience and strong understanding of our industry and the U.S. healthcare markets will allow him to hit the ground running, drive our transformation and fulfill our purpose to help people lead healthier and happier lives across America," executive vice chairman and

The accreditation is based on of National Association of Chain also planned to accept donations, with 100 percent going to the Red

"We extend our deepest sympathies to everyone throughout communities that have been impacted by the storm. It is imperative that we do our part to help during such difficult times,' said Walgreens regional vice president of the Midwest region

Scout adding

Scout Clean Energy this week announced plans to add solar and battery storage components to a proposed wind farm in Benton County, Washington.

Scout, which is in the final stages of constructing Bitter Ridge Wind Farm in southwestern Jay County, has been working on development of the Washington facility since 2016. The wind farm is expected to produce 850 megawatts of combined wind, solar and batter power.

"Scout has been monitoring power market interest for solar and storage technology along with wind, referred to as a hybrid facility," said Scout project manager Dave Kobus in a press release. "Recent improvements in technology have created the economic conditions needed to sup-

port demand for co-locating a wind-solar-battery storage project in the Horse Heaven Hills."

The Commercial Review/Katie Lyons

Jay County Chamber of Commerce held a ribbon-cutting ceremony Friday for Bizy Dips Bakery and Coffee Shop, which will be located in John Jay Center for Learning, 101 S. Meridian St., Portland. Following a soft opening Friday, the business will open to the public Tuesday.

Bizy

Continued from page 1 He's taken the supportive role in helping Hannah achieve her dream busi-

the official taste-tester," he said.

Patrick is also helping his wife with marketing, but he noted she has the final say in all decisions.

Rusty Inman, executive director of John Jay Center for Learning, said the organization's board proposed in November that "I'm not a baker — I'm it might be nice to have a coffee shop or meeting place.

> After connecting with a few different business owners, they chose Bizy Dips.

Inman thinks both Bizy Dips and John Jay will have a mutually beneficial relationship.

"I'm excited to bring people in the door," he

McAbee noted that she's proud of her daughter for starting a bakery.

"It's like an art to her; she's just really good at

it," McAbee said. "I'm the mom — I'm supposed to be teaching (her) recipes, but she's always giving me recipes."

Bustings

Auto Sules



*The Jay County Visitor & Tourism Bureau has graciously agreed to pay for half of the building rental fee for the first 10 rentals of our newly renovated building. The rental needs to be some sort of class/activity that will help bring people to Pennville.

Manure Management Cover Crop-Soil Health Field Day PARP Credits

September 10 – 1:00-5:00 PM 5948W SR 67, Portland, IN

Manure Management Presentations Cover Crop Equipment and Rain Simulator Demonstrations Field Day held in partnership with

Jay & Blackford Soil & WaterConservation Districts Purdue Extension & Clean Water Indiana

For additional information contact **Jay County SWCD at 260-726-4888**



2018 Chevrolet Equinox LT FWD, Remote Start, Bluetooth, Heated

Front Seats 34,000 miles

\$17,500

110 S. Wayne St.

Vehicle **Service Center** Certified in: ACS · ASE

M-Tu-Th-Fr 7 a.m.-5

p.m. · Wed. 7 a.m.-7

p.m.

Sat. 7:30 a.m.-1:00 p.m.

FINANCING

AVAILABLE







1 LT FWD, Bluetooth, Remoter Start,

LOCAL TRADE, Backup Camera, 94,000

\$7,900

2017 Ford Fusion

Local trade, backup camera, bluetooth

\$11,900



2013 Chevrolet Equinox 2017 Toyota RAV4 SE AWD Bluetooth, Heated leather seats, Sunroof



\$24.325 **We're Open late on Wednesdays!**

Seats. DVD system, 32,000 miles \$26,595 Visit Us 24/7

PROJECT BENEFITS

https://horseheavencleanenergy.com/meet-dave-kobus-senior-project-manager-with-horse-heaven-clean-energy-center/

CLEAN ENERGY IN WA

FAQ

NEWS

SUBSCRIB

TAKE ACTION

Meet Dave Kobus: Senior Project Manager with Horse Heaven Clean Energy Center

≺ Back

Dave Kobus grew up working on his family's dairy farm in a small town. There he developed a deep appreciation for the land and people who worked it. He knows that farming is a calling and that those who rely on agriculture face many challenges in their efforts to feed the community and provide for their families. That's one of his many motivators today as the Senior Project Manager for Horse Heaven Clean Energy Center.

Dave left his hometown to join the Navy where he served on nuclear submarines. He transitioned his post to serve as a prototype instructor to train the next generation of Navy nuclear operators. This was the catalyst for Dave's passion supporting the professional development, education and career connections for young professionals and kids alike, which continues to this day as a team leader, project developer and grandfather.

"One of the most satisfying facets of my career has been the ability to assimilate and develop new talent," said Dave. "I am often surprised at what people can do based on a tip or a nudge, which makes it worthwhile for me to invest my time to help them build the foundational knowledge necessary for their future accomplishments."

While in the service, Dave married and started to envision a life with a family and career that would make a meaningful difference. At the same time, his interest in nuclear technology grew. Following eight years in the service, Dave began working for energy industry groups across the country and engrossed himself in college coursework that expanded his understanding of energy technology. While working, he earned his undergraduate degree in nuclear technology and then a Master's in engineering management from Washington State University Tri-Cities.



Soon after, Energy Northwest decided to move forward with a wind development project. Because of his volunteerism in renewable energy with the company, Dave became the lead renewable developer for the Nine Canyon Wind Project – a single wind project built in three phases that spanned 10 years of his career.

"I'm really proud of that project and I learned a lot about how interrelated our energy system is," said Dave. "I feel passionate about what I do – it's why I got started in it and it keeps me going through the peaks and valleys of a development cycle. I can point to those wind turbines and know exactly how they benefit my community. That keeps me going for these long-term projects."

When the opportunity to lead the development of Horse Heaven Clean Energy Center (HHCEC) arose, Dave did not hesitate to join. With deep knowledge of the existing energy infrastructure in the region, combined with his passion for contributing positively to his community, HHCEC was a perfect fit.

In his role with HHCEC, Dave builds teams of consultants who can provide top level expertise for each aspect of the project. He evaluates what consultants are preparing, does his research and asks any questions needed to fill in the full picture of the project. He notes that very few people in the energy industry have expertise in all aspects of the industry, so it is vitally important to build teams of experts who can go deep on specific subjects. While rare to find someone who knows it all, Dave prepares himself with up-to-date information on the status of everything related to the HHCEC development.

"As the region grows, we will need more energy supply. And it takes a diverse mix of technology to be able to create that reliable and robust supply," said Dave. "It took me a long time to grasp how energy sources and supply are interrelated, so I understand where people are coming from when they have questions. It's really important to me that I am able to explain this project to anyone, and to demonstrate how exciting this project really is."

For Dave, this project is a labor of love and a promise to his community, including his grandchildren, that the Tri-Cities can be an energy hub. He connects it to the Tri-Cities economic development plans which aim to create long-lasting skilled professional jobs for the lifetime of a project. Dave envisions a self-sustaining energy tech industry for the region, which utilizes the amazing renewable resources available locally to keep a strong employment pipeline available for future generations. With more opportunities to enter in these high-skill fields, more young people from the region can build their future career plans locally.

"Those wind turbines can spark curiosity for kids – just like they did for me in Palm Springs. My grandsons see me working on this project, and they see the turbines. I want them to see how they can fashion a career and a life that allows them to explore their passions while leaving a legacy too."

Dave also views this project as a way of enhancing the quality of life around the region. From being self-sufficient suppliers of their own energy to the economic investments that go into local efforts, Dave prefers having wind and solar developments locally, so the benefits come directly into his own community. Based on his lifetime of experience, he believes that If you can see them, you are sharing in their benefits.

"I think its inspirational as it's a sustainable way to generate the power we all need while providing resources that benefit everyone in various ways to ensure a thriving community. It's a graceful solution to address several of our community's pressing needs."

This includes the checks he plays a part in delivering to local farmers who are partnered with the project to lease portions of their land. Connecting with his roots, Dave understands how the HHCEC can lift farmers with additional revenues.

"I'm working for these landowners and the people who have spent their entire lives in debt to get the equipment they need earn a living in agriculture," said Dave. "To have this additional resource means they could send their kids to college, buy the equipment they need to invest back into their farming operations, and spend their money in town which creates an

 $economic\ multiplier\ -\ improving\ the\ quality\ of\ life\ for\ everyone."$

"At the end of the day I have to look in the mirror and feel good about what I'm doing and that it's for the overall good," he continued. "With this project, I am serving the community in what I do."

Subscribe for Updates



(509) 490-4892

 $\ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$ 2021 Horse Heaven Clean Energy Center. All Rights Reserved

Privacy Policy



horseheaven@scoutcleanenergy.com

1

2

BEFORE THE STATE OF WASHINGTON **ENERGY FACILITY SITING EVALUATION COUNCIL**

In the Matter of the Application of:

Scout Clean Energy, LLC, for Horse Heaven Wind Farm, LLC, Applicant. DOCKET NO. EF-210011

NOTICE OF INTENTION TO TAKE DEPOSITION OF DAVID **KOBUS**

TO:

DAVID KOBUS, Scout Clean Energy Senior Project Manager

AND TO:

Tim McMahon and Stoel Rives, attorneys for Applicant Scout Clean

Energy and Horse Heaven Wind Farm;

AND TO:

Counsel of Record

Please take notice that the testimony of DAVID KOBUS will be taken Virtually on oral examination, under oath, before a Notary Public / court reporter, at the following time, date and place:

DATE:

Monday, June 5, 2023

TIME:

9:30 a.m.

PLACE:

Verb8tim Court Reporting to provide Zoom link.

This oral examination will be subject to continuance or adjournment from time to time or place to place until completed.

DATED this Loday of May, 2023

J. Richard Aramburu, WSBA #466 Attorney for Tri-Cities C.A.R.E.S.

25

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26

27

28

NOTICE OF INTENTION TO TAKE DEPOSITION OF DAVID KOBUS - 1

DECLARATION OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served the foregoing Notice of Deposition upon all parties of record in this proceeding listed on the following page(s), by authorized method of service pursuant to WAC 463-30-120(3) to the email or street addresses for for parties as provided.

Dated at Seattle, Washington this 26th day of May, 2023.

Carol Cohoe, Legal Assistant Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu, PLLC

PARTIES OF RECORD

2	Kenneth Harper, Aziza Foster
3	Menke Jackson Beyer, LLP 807 North 39 th Avenue
١	Yakima WA 98902
4	By Email: kharper@mjbe.com;
_	zfoster@mjbe.com; Julie@mjbe.com
5	Ryan Brown
6	Chief Deputy Prosecuting Attorney
_	Benton County Prosecuting Attorney
7	7211 West Okanogan Place, Building A Kennewick, WA 99336
8	Counsel for Benton County
	By Email:
9	Ryan.Brown@co.benton.wa.us
10	Sarah Reyneveld
	Office of the Attorney General
11	800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
12	Seattle, WA 98104-3188 Counsel for the Environment
	By Email:
13	Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov
14	CEPSeaEF@atg.wa.gov; julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov
	Jano. donon @ atg. wa. gov
15	Tim McMahan
16	Stoel Rives LLP 760 SW Ninth Avenue, Suite 3000
10	Portland, OR 97205
17	Counsel for Scout Clean Energy, LLC
18	By Email: tim.mcmahan@stoel.com emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com;
10	ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com
19	
20	Shona Voelckers Yakama Nation
20	shona@yakamanation-olc.org
21	ethan@yakamanation-olc.org
00	jessica@yakamanation-olc.org
22	
23	
	EFSEC Staff
24	lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov; alex.shiley@efsec.wa.gov;
25	andrea.grantham@efsec.wa.gov;
00	sonia.bumpus@efsec.wa.gov

Washington State Department of Agriculture Natural Resources Building, 2nd Floor P.O. Box 42560 1111 Washington St. SE Olympia, WA 98504-2560

Washington State Department of Commerce 1011 Plum Street SE P.O. Box 42525 Olympia, WA 98504-2525

Washington State Department of Ecology P.O. Box 47600 Olympia, WA 98504-7600

Washington State Department of Fish and Wildlife Natural Resources Building 1111 Washington St. SE Olympia, WA 98501

Washington State Department of Natural Resources Natural Resources Building MS 47000, Olympia, WA 98504 1111 Washington St. SE Olympia, WA 98504

Washington State Utilities and Transportation Commission MAILSTOP/PO BOX: 431 621 Woodland Sq Loop SE Lacey, WA 98503-0361

26

1

27

28

Deposition of Dave Kobus

Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Thu 6/15/2023 3:22 PM

To:McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>;adamtorem@writeme.com

<adamtorem@writeme.com>

Cc:Aziza Foster <zfoster@mjbe.com>;Dolloff, Julie K (ATG)

<julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov>;Ethan Jones <Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org>;Jessica Houston

<jessica@yakamanation-olc.org>;Julie Kihn <Julie@mjbe.com>;Ken Harper

<kharper@mjbe.com>;Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)

lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>;Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>;Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>;Shona Voelckers <shona@yakamanation-

olc.org>;Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) <jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>;Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Bcc:aramburulaw@gmail.com <aramburulaw@gmail.com>;'Dave Sharp'

<dave@tricitiescares.org>;pam@tricitiescares.org <pam@tricitiescares.org>;Paul Krupin

<Paul@Presari.com>

Mr. McMahan:

I write to reschedule the deposition of Mr. Kobus, who was unavailable for deposition on the previously noted date of June 5, 2023. I would like to take Mr. Kobus deposition on **10 am on June 22, 2023** in a virtual format, but I am also available to take his deposition on Friday, June 23. I will be asking him questions about the original and amended ASC.

In this email, I am only copying party representatives.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 30, 2023 12:03 PM

To: adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Bumpus, Sonia (EFSEC) <sonia.bumpus@efsec.wa.gov>; Moon, Amy (EFSEC)

1 of 2 6/24/2023, 9:56 AM

Hello Judge Torem – Please find attached a letter responding to TCC regarding TCC's demand to take the deposition of Dave Kobus. Thank you for your attention to this matter. Best, TLM

Tim McMahan | Partner STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205 Direct: (503) 294-9517 | Mobile: (503) 504-8693 tim.mcmahan@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.

2 of 2 6/24/2023, 9:56 AM

RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Fri 6/16/2023 2:42 PM

To:Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Cc:Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) < Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>;ethan@yakamanation-olc.org < ethan@yakamanation-olc.org>;jessica@yakamanation-olc.org < jessica@yakamanation-olc.org>;Julie@mjbe.com < Julie@mjbe.com >;kharper@mjbe.com

- <kharper@mjbe.com>;Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)
- lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>;Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)
- <Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>;shona@yakamanation-olc.org <shona@yakamanationolc.org>;Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) <jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>;McMahan, Tim
 <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>;Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>;Schimelpfenig,
 Emily K. <emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Bcc:'Dave Sharp' <dave@tricitiescares.org>;pam@tricitiescares.org <pam@tricitiescares.org>;Paul Krupin <Paul@Presari.com>

Ms. Perlmutter:

The applicant's continuing efforts to delay and impede discovery are entirely inconsistent with the Examiner's orders and determinations, as well as the Civil Rules on discovery, CR 26-37.

We are cognizant of the Examiner's rulings and well aware of the "disputed issues for adjudication." If you think during the course of Mr. Kobus deposition that questions are improper, you may exercise your right to object. Regarding the "coordination" of TCC with those of Benton County, please be advised that we are fully following the Examiner's direction and communicating and cooperating with the County.

To date, we have attempted to engage in informal means of settlement of discovery issues as provided in PHO#2. However, further delay and unwarranted interference with TCC's right to engage in discovery are entirely inappropriate. If the Applicant continues to refuse to make its project manager Mr. Kobus available for deposition, we will seek orders to compel his attendance and appropriate relief, including additional time for presentation of testimony.

(We have deleted Judge Torem from the email string as he is not a party to these discussions.)

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Sent: Thursday, June 15, 2023 4:51 PM

To: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>; Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Cc: Adam Torem (adamtorem@writeme.com) <adamtorem@writeme.com>;

zfoster@mjbe.com <zfoster@mjbe.com>; Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org; jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie@mjbe.com;

kharper@mjbe.com <kharper@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)

sa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG) <Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>;

shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>; Stavitsky,

Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: FW: Deposition of Dave Kobus

Good afternoon, Mr. Aramburu.

I am responding to your email this afternoon to my colleague Tim McMahan, regarding your proposal to take Dave Kobus's deposition next week. We are checking with Mr. Kobus about his availability and we will circle back to you on that shortly.

In the meantime, however, please understand that your extremely broad and vague statement that you intend to ask Mr. Kobus "about the original and amended ASC" is unacceptable as we determine whether to make Mr. Kobus available for deposition. As you know, Judge Torem directed that "the parties' pre-filed testimony shall serve as the chief source of discovering each party's principal positions" and "any additional discovery must seek only information that is relevant to the approved issues for the adjudication." Second Pre-Hearing Conference Order, p. 4 (May 19, 2023). Your representation about the intended scope of Mr. Kobus's deposition clearly falls very wide of Judge Torem's unambiguous instruction. Any questions you plan to ask Mr. Kobus have to be limited to those that are consistent with TCC's role as an intervenor in this case: specifically, "the organization's significant interest in wildlife and ecosystem conservation as well as local decision-making to preserve the community's uniquely picturesque natural landscapes." Mr. Kobus will answer questions on those limited subjects. Moreover, we will not agree to allow Mr. Kobus to respond to any questions regarding land use topics, as Judge Torem affirmatively identified Benton County as the lead for those issues. *Id.*, p. 5

We hope that we can agree to these limitations without the need to involve Judge Torem any more than necessary. Please confirm in writing that you will agree to limit your questions to the areas identified by the judge and we will work with you to get Mr. Kobus's deposition scheduled for next week. Absent your confirmation we do not intend to produce Mr. Kobus voluntarily – but of course we hope that it will not be necessary for us to refuse to produce him or to ask the judge to weigh in.

Additionally, as a housekeeping matter, please note that as we previously advised you, I'll be

working with Tim McMahan and with the rest of the Horse Heaven team as litigation counsel. To that end, I'd appreciate it if you would include me on all correspondence going forward.

We look forward to your agreement to the approach we've outlined. Once we get your confirmation we'll firm up a date and time for Mr. Kobus's deposition.

Many thanks,

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531

willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



Begin forwarded message:

From: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Date: June 15, 2023 at 3:22:23 PM PDT

To: "McMahan, Tim" < tim.mcmahan@stoel.com >,

adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Aziza Foster <<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u>>, "Dolloff, Julie K (ATG)"

<julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov>, Ethan Jones < Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org>,

Jessica Houston < jessica@yakamanation-olc.org >, Julie Kihn

< <u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>>, Ken Harper < <u>kharper@mjbe.com</u>>, "Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)" < <u>lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov</u>>, "Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)"

<sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>, "Schimelpfenig, Emily K."

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>, Shona Voelckers

<shona@yakamanation-olc.org>, "Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)"

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>, "Stavitsky, Ariel H."

<ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Subject: Deposition of Dave Kobus

Mr. McMahan:

I write to reschedule the deposition of Mr. Kobus, who was unavailable for deposition on the previously noted date of June 5, 2023. I would like to take Mr. Kobus deposition on **10 am on June 22, 2023** in a virtual format, but I am also available to take his deposition on Friday, June 23. I will be asking him questions about the original and amended ASC.

In this email, I am only copying party representatives.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 30, 2023 12:03 PM

To: adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Bumpus, Sonia (EFSEC) <sonia.bumpus@efsec.wa.gov>; Moon, Amy (EFSEC)

<amy.moon@efsec.wa.gov>; adjudication@efsec.wa.gov;

<u>aramburulaw@gmail.com</u>; Aziza Foster <<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u>>; Dolloff, Julie K
(ATG) <<u>julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov</u>>; Ethan Jones <<u>Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org</u>>;

Jessica Houston < jessica@yakamanation-olc.org>; Julie Kihn < Julie@mjbe.com>;

Ken Harper < kharper@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)

<a href="mailto:Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>; Shona Voelckers <shona@yakamanation-</pre>

olc.org>; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) < jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>;

Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Subject: Horse Heaven Wind Farm Docket #EF-210011; Response to TCC's Demand for Deposition

Hello Judge Torem – Please find attached a letter responding to TCC regarding TCC's demand to take the deposition of Dave Kobus. Thank you for your attention to this matter. Best, TLM

Tim McMahan | Partner

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9517 | Mobile: (503) 504-8693

tim.mcmahan@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.

Carol Cohoe

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Sent: Sunday, June 18, 2023 3:42 PM

To: Rick Aramburu

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG); ethan@yakamanation-olc.org;

jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie@mjbe.com; kharper@mjbe.com;

Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC); Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG);

shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG); McMahan, Tim; Stavitsky, Ariel H.; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Good afternoon, Mr. Aramburu.

As I hope my previous email made clear, we are <u>not</u> refusing to make Mr. Kobus available for a deposition. We are, however, unwilling to make him available for questioning if TCC will not agree in advance to limit the scope of the deposition to the fairly narrow range of issues that Judge Torem has identified as the scope of your client's involvement in this matter. We trust you will understand that simply reminding us of our right to object to improper questioning is not a helpful solution to our concern that your plan to question Mr. Kobus "about the original and amended ASC," without reasonable limitations, will result in a fishing expedition not contemplated either by the orders in this case or by the rules of discovery.

We would be happy to talk with you in an attempt to arrive at an agreement on a reasonable scope for the deposition you seek. If you continue to insist on conducting a free-ranging deposition without regard to the defined scope of the adjudication or of TCC's identified role therein, however, you may need to file your threatened motion and at that point we can all ask for Judge Torem's input. Once more, however, please understand that we hope that will not be necessary and that we can reach a reasonable accommodation that gets you what you need – while still respecting the appropriate statutory and procedural status of this matter and TCC's narrowly defined role in it.

Many thanks,

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531

willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



From: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Sent: Friday, June 16, 2023 2:42 PM

To: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) < Julie. Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org;

jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie@mjbe.com; kharper@mjbe.com <kharper@mjbe.com>;

Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) < lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>; Stavitsky, Ariel H.

<ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfeniq, Emily K. <emily.schimelpfeniq@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Ms. Perlmutter:

The applicant's continuing efforts to delay and impede discovery are entirely inconsistent with the Examiner's orders and determinations, as well as the Civil Rules on discovery, CR 26-37.

We are cognizant of the Examiner's rulings and well aware of the "disputed issues for adjudication." If you think during the course of Mr. Kobus deposition that questions are improper, you may exercise your right to object. Regarding the "coordination" of TCC with those of Benton County, please be advised that we are fully following the Examiner's direction and communicating and cooperating with the County.

To date, we have attempted to engage in informal means of settlement of discovery issues as provided in PHO#2. However, further delay and unwarranted interference with TCC's right to engage in discovery are entirely inappropriate. If the Applicant continues to refuse to make its project manager Mr. Kobus available for deposition, we will seek orders to compel his attendance and appropriate relief, including additional time for presentation of testimony.

(We have deleted Judge Torem from the email string as he is not a party to these discussions.)

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Sent: Thursday, June 15, 2023 4:51 PM

To: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>; Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Cc: Adam Torem (adamtorem@writeme.com) <adamtorem@writeme.com>; zfoster@mjbe.com

<<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u>>; Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <<u>Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov</u>>; <u>ethan@yakamanation-olc.org</u>;

<u>jessica@yakamanation-olc.org</u>; <u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>; <u>kharper@mjbe.com</u> < <u>kharper@mjbe.com</u> >;

Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) < !lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov">; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

< <u>Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov</u>>; <u>shona@yakamanation-olc.org</u>; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

<<u>ionathan.thompson@atq.wa.gov</u>>; McMahan, Tim <<u>tim.mcmahan@stoel.com</u>>; Stavitsky, Ariel H.

<ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfeniq, Emily K. <emily.schimelpfeniq@stoel.com>

Subject: FW: Deposition of Dave Kobus

Good afternoon, Mr. Aramburu.

I am responding to your email this afternoon to my colleague Tim McMahan, regarding your proposal to take Dave Kobus's deposition next week. We are checking with Mr. Kobus about his availability and we will circle back to you on that shortly.

In the meantime, however, please understand that your extremely broad and vague statement that you intend to ask Mr. Kobus "about the original and amended ASC" is unacceptable as we determine whether to make Mr. Kobus available for deposition. As you know, Judge Torem directed that "the parties' pre-filed testimony shall serve as the chief source of discovering each party's principal positions" and "any additional discovery must seek only information that is relevant to the approved issues for the adjudication." Second Pre-Hearing Conference Order, p. 4 (May 19, 2023). Your representation about the intended scope of Mr. Kobus's deposition clearly falls very wide of Judge Torem's unambiguous instruction. Any questions you plan to ask Mr. Kobus have to be limited to those that are consistent with TCC's role as an intervenor in this case: specifically, "the organization's significant interest in wildlife and ecosystem conservation as well as local decision-making to preserve the community's uniquely picturesque natural landscapes." Mr. Kobus will answer questions on those limited subjects. Moreover, we will not agree to allow Mr. Kobus to respond to any questions regarding land use topics, as Judge Torem affirmatively identified Benton County as the lead for those issues. *Id.*, p. 5

We hope that we can agree to these limitations without the need to involve Judge Torem any more than necessary. Please confirm in writing that you will agree to limit your questions to the areas identified by the judge and we will work with you to get Mr. Kobus's deposition scheduled for next week. Absent your confirmation we do not intend to produce Mr. Kobus voluntarily – but of course we hope that it will not be necessary for us to refuse to produce him or to ask the judge to weigh in.

Additionally, as a housekeeping matter, please note that as we previously advised you, I'll be working with Tim McMahan and with the rest of the Horse Heaven team as litigation counsel. To that end, I'd appreciate it if you would include me on all correspondence going forward.

We look forward to your agreement to the approach we've outlined. Once we get your confirmation we'll firm up a date and time for Mr. Kobus's deposition.

Many thanks,

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531

willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



Begin forwarded message:

From: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Date: June 15, 2023 at 3:22:23 PM PDT

To: "McMahan, Tim" < tim.mcmahan@stoel.com >, adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Aziza Foster <<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u>>, "Dolloff, Julie K (ATG)"

<julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov>, Ethan Jones <Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org>,

Jessica Houston < jessica@yakamanation-olc.org>, Julie Kihn

< <u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>>, Ken Harper < <u>kharper@mjbe.com</u>>, "Masengale, Lisa

(EFSEC)" < lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>, "Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)"

<sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>, "Schimelpfenig, Emily K."

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>, Shona Voelckers <shona@yakamanation-</pre>

olc.org>, "Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)" < jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>,

"Stavitsky, Ariel H." <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Subject: Deposition of Dave Kobus

Mr. McMahan:

I write to reschedule the deposition of Mr. Kobus, who was unavailable for deposition on the previously noted date of June 5, 2023. I would like to take Mr. Kobus deposition on 10 am on June 22, 2023 in a virtual format, but I am also available to take his

deposition on Friday, June 23. I will be asking him questions about the original and amended ASC.

In this email, I am only copying party representatives.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 30, 2023 12:03 PM

To: adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Bumpus, Sonia (EFSEC) <<u>sonia.bumpus@efsec.wa.gov</u>>; Moon, Amy (EFSEC) <<u>amy.moon@efsec.wa.gov</u>>; <u>adjudication@efsec.wa.gov</u>; <u>aramburulaw@gmail.com</u>; Aziza Foster <<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u>>; Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <<u>julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov</u>>; Ethan Jones <<u>Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org</u>>; Jessica Houston <<u>jessica@yakamanation-olc.org</u>>; Julie Kihn <<u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>>; Ken Harper <<u>kharper@mjbe.com</u>>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) <<u>lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov</u>>; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>; Shona Voelckers <shona@yakamanation-olc.org>; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) <jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; Stavitsky, Ariel H.<ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Subject: Horse Heaven Wind Farm Docket #EF-210011; Response to TCC's Demand for Deposition

Hello Judge Torem – Please find attached a letter responding to TCC regarding TCC's demand to take the deposition of Dave Kobus. Thank you for your attention to this matter. Best, TLM

Tim McMahan | Partner STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205 Direct: (503) 294-9517 | Mobile: (503) 504-8693 tim.mcmahan@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.

RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Fri 6/23/2023 2:46 PM

To:Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>;Ken Harper <kharper@mjbe.com>
Cc:Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>;ethan@yakamanation-olc.org
<ethan@yakamanation-olc.org>;jessica@yakamanation-olc.org <jessica@yakamanation-olc.org>;Julie Kihn <Julie@mjbe.com>;Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)
lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov;Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>;shona@yakamanation-olc.org <shona@yakamanationolc.org>;Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) <jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>;McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>;Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>;Schimelpfenig, Emily K. <emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Ms. Perlmutter:

Quite frankly we are tired of the applicant's delay in producing its long standing project manager for deposition.

We originally scheduled his deposition by notice on May 26 for June 5 so it would be available for use for the first round of testimony due June 12. You refused to make him available, and we missed the June 12 deadline. Following an exchange of communication regarding his testimony, on June 15, we asked you to make Mr. Kobus available for deposition on June 22, so we could use his testimony for the rebuttal round of testimony due June 30. Scout continued its obdurate refusal to make him available and now his testimony will not be available for the June 30 testimony. Your suggestion that we meet next week means it is likely we will not have his testimony even for the final round of testimony due July 12. The Applicant's behavior is contrary to the terms of the Civil Rules and the Examiner prior orders. Regrettably, we have no choice but to promptly file our motion to compel.

Your email states the Applicant wants undescribed "guardrails" for testimony, but PHO#2 has already set those guardrails coming after a lengthy prehearing conference on May 2. The Applicant did not ask for more restrictions or "guardrails" after receiving PHO#2, which specifically allowed for discovery under the Civil Rules.

If the Applicant has objections on relevance grounds, limited as they are by CR 26, they can be made at the deposition. I am still willing to consider whatever "guardrails" you propose, but I must have them by the end of the day given the need to promptly set Mr. Kobus deposition.

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Sent: Friday, June 23, 2023 8:57 AM

To: Ken Harper <kharper@mjbe.com>; Rick Aramburu <Rick@aramburulaw.com>
Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org;
jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie Kihn <Julie@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)
lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG) <Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>;
shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)
<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>; Stavitsky,
Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Good morning to you both.

Here's a suggestion that might help us move forward with regard to Mr. Kobus's deposition. We'd propose a call among the three of us to see if we can't iron out an agreement regarding the permissible scope of questioning. As we've indicated in previous emails, we're happy to make him available as long as we can put reasonable guardrails on the subjects for deposition. It seems to me that rather than trying to fight it out by email, our clients might be well served if we just get on the phone and try to talk it out.

What's your thought? Today isn't good for me, but next week I have pretty good availability. On Monday I can be available until about 3:30, and later in the week I have some flexibility and could make time to talk. If you tell me what works, I can set up a call on Zoom or Teams, as you prefer.

I hope we can get things back on track so we can get Mr. Kobus deposed and move on from there.

Many thanks,

Willa.

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205 Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531 willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



From: Ken Harper < kharper@mjbe.com>
Sent: Wednesday, June 21, 2023 10:53 AM

To: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>; Rick Aramburu

<Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org; jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie Kihn <Julie@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG) <Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) <jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>; Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K. <emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Ms. Perlmutter:

I write to point out that the County may also have questions for Mr. Kobus. Your statement from the below email chain ("Moreover, we will not agree to allow Mr. Kobus to respond to any questions regarding land use topics, as Judge Torem affirmatively identified Benton County as the lead for those issues. *Id.*, p. 5") is not well-taken because we do not agree that Mr. Aramburu's deposition is limited to only questions he asks. The County plans to attend the deposition and may ask questions of its own. Nor do we agree that Judge Torem's ruling has the preclusive effect you clam in any event.

I will continue to monitor your and Mr. Aramburu's efforts to reach an accommodation so that Mr. Kobus' deposition may be scheduled, but wanted to state our position clearly.

K

Kenneth W. Harper Menke Jackson Beyer, LLP 807 North 39th Avenue

Yakima, WA 98902 USA 509-575-0313 509-575-0351 (fax) kharper@mjbe.com www.mjbe.com

Confidentiality Notice: This email may contain confidential and privileged information. If you have received this email by mistake, please notify me immediately by replying to this email or telephoning me and do not review, disclose, copy, or distribute.

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. < <u>willa.perlmutter@stoel.com</u>>

Sent: Tuesday, June 20, 2023 1:53 PM

To: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com >

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) < Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov >; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org;

jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie Kihn < Julie@mjbe.com >; Ken Harper

<kharper@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>; Reyneveld,

Sarah (ATG) <Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson,

Jonathan C (ATG) < jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov >; McMahan, Tim

<ti>.cm.mcmahan@stoel.com; Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com</td>; Schimelpfenig,

Emily K. <emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Good afternoon, Mr. Aramburu.

Here's what we suggest as a possible way to break our current impasse. If you'll submit the questions you'd like to ask Mr. Kobus, we'll undertake to have Mr. Kobus answer them in good faith, in writing and under oath, subject to the objections we're raising as to scope.

If that won't work for you and your client, it would appear the parties might need to ask Judge Torem to weigh in with direction as to the limits, if any, to be put on your lines of questioning for Mr. Kobus. We still hope you'll voluntarily agree to limit the scope of Mr. Kobus's deposition to something less than the entire universe of issues the original and amended applications might touch upon, in which case none of this will be necessary and we can get the deposition scheduled in short order. In the alternative, as noted, we'd be happy to submit your questions to Mr. Kobus for written answers. Failing that, we'll wait for the motion you seem to feel is necessary.

That said, however, if you have another solution, we'd be happy to discuss it with you in an effort to get this moving forward again.

Many thanks,

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531

willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



From: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Sent: Monday, June 19, 2023 1:54 PM

To: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) < <u>Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov</u>>; <u>ethan@yakamanation-olc.org</u>;

jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie@mjbe.com; kharper@mjbe.com <kharper@mjbe.com>;

Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) < lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov>; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>; Stavitsky,

Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Dear Ms. Perlmutter:

You contend that the Judge Torem has established a "narrow range of issues" identified in PHO#2. That is not the case. As Judge Torem stated at page 3 of PHO#2:

The <u>scope</u> and intent of these <u>approved</u> issues will be <u>broadly construed</u> to allow parties to present their individual case for and against the project, subject to motions to strike irrelevant evidence or witness testimony that is <u>clearly outside</u> the scope of EFSEC's review process.

(Emphasis supplied). Judge Torem identified other issues also on page 3 of this order, stating that:

Although the approved issued list (sic) above <u>will be broadly construed</u>, the following issues will *not* be taken up during the adjudication unless specifically authorized by subsequent order

(Underline supplied, italics in original). We do understand that, though we disagree with the ruling and have noted our objections, issues in the second category are off limits.

Discovery has been authorized in this case and the choice of discovery to be employed is generally up to the inquiring party. Judge Torem has stated the identified issues will be "broadly construed" and objection can be made if you think questions are improper. However, there is no basis for a broad exclusion of testimony. It is well-settled law that if a party seeks to avoid discovery, it must move for a protective order, not just unilaterally decide matters are not subject to discovery based on its interpretation of the legal issues. See *Taylor v Cessna Aircraft Co.*, 39 Wn App 828, 836 (1985) (1985).

We request for the third time that the project manager, Mr. Kobus appear for this deposition at the time previously requested.

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Sent: Sunday, June 18, 2023 3:42 PM

To: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) < Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov >; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org; jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie@mjbe.com; kharper@mjbe.com < kharper@mjbe.com >;

Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) < !isa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov">: Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<<u>Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov</u>>; <u>shona@yakamanation-olc.org</u>; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>; Stavitsky,

Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Good afternoon, Mr. Aramburu.

As I hope my previous email made clear, we are <u>not</u> refusing to make Mr. Kobus available for a deposition. We are, however, unwilling to make him available for questioning if TCC will not agree in advance to limit the scope of the deposition to the fairly narrow range of issues that Judge Torem has identified as the scope of your client's involvement in this matter. We trust you will understand that simply reminding us of our right to object to improper questioning is not a helpful solution to our concern that your plan to question Mr. Kobus "about the original"

and amended ASC," without reasonable limitations, will result in a fishing expedition not contemplated either by the orders in this case or by the rules of discovery.

We would be happy to talk with you in an attempt to arrive at an agreement on a reasonable scope for the deposition you seek. If you continue to insist on conducting a free-ranging deposition without regard to the defined scope of the adjudication or of TCC's identified role therein, however, you may need to file your threatened motion and at that point we can all ask for Judge Torem's input. Once more, however, please understand that we hope that will not be necessary and that we can reach a reasonable accommodation that gets you what you need – while still respecting the appropriate statutory and procedural status of this matter and TCC's narrowly defined role in it.

Many thanks,

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531

willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



From: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Sent: Friday, June 16, 2023 2:42 PM

To: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Cc: Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) < Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov>; ethan@yakamanation-olc.org;

jessica@yakamanation-olc.org; Julie@mjbe.com; kharper@mjbe.com <kharper@mjbe.com>;

Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC) < !isa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov">: Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>; McMahan, Tim <<u>tim.mcmahan@stoel.com</u>>; Stavitsky,

Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: RE: Deposition of Dave Kobus. June 22, 2023 at 10 am

Ms. Perlmutter:

The applicant's continuing efforts to delay and impede discovery are entirely inconsistent with the Examiner's orders and determinations, as well as the Civil Rules on discovery, CR 26-37.

We are cognizant of the Examiner's rulings and well aware of the "disputed issues for adjudication." If you think during the course of Mr. Kobus deposition that questions are improper, you may exercise your right to object. Regarding the "coordination" of TCC with those of Benton County, please be advised that we are fully following the Examiner's direction and communicating and cooperating with the County.

To date, we have attempted to engage in informal means of settlement of discovery issues as provided in PHO#2. However, further delay and unwarranted interference with TCC's right to engage in discovery are entirely inappropriate. If the Applicant continues to refuse to make its project manager Mr. Kobus available for deposition, we will seek orders to compel his attendance and appropriate relief, including additional time for presentation of testimony.

(We have deleted Judge Torem from the email string as he is not a party to these discussions.)

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu 705 2nd Ave #1300 Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: Perlmutter, Willa B. <willa.perlmutter@stoel.com>

Sent: Thursday, June 15, 2023 4:51 PM

To: Rick Aramburu <Rick@aramburulaw.com>; Rick Aramburu <Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Cc: Adam Torem (adamtorem@writeme.com) <adamtorem@writeme.com>;

<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u> <<u>zfoster@mjbe.com</u>>; Dolloff, Julie K (ATG) <<u>Julie.Dolloff@atg.wa.gov</u>>; <u>ethan@yakamanation-olc.org</u>; <u>jessica@yakamanation-olc.org</u>; <u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>;

kharper@mjbe.com <kharper@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)

<sarah (ATG) <<a href=

shona@yakamanation-olc.org; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)

Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>

Subject: FW: Deposition of Dave Kobus

Good afternoon, Mr. Aramburu.

I am responding to your email this afternoon to my colleague Tim McMahan, regarding your proposal to take Dave Kobus's deposition next week. We are checking with Mr. Kobus about his availability and we will circle back to you on that shortly.

In the meantime, however, please understand that your extremely broad and vague statement that you intend to ask Mr. Kobus "about the original and amended ASC" is unacceptable as we determine whether to make Mr. Kobus available for deposition. As you know, Judge Torem directed that "the parties' pre-filed testimony shall serve as the chief source of discovering each party's principal positions" and "any additional discovery must seek only information that is relevant to the approved issues for the adjudication." Second Pre-Hearing Conference Order, p. 4 (May 19, 2023). Your representation about the intended scope of Mr. Kobus's deposition clearly falls very wide of Judge Torem's unambiguous instruction. Any questions you plan to ask Mr. Kobus have to be limited to those that are consistent with TCC's role as an intervenor in this case: specifically, "the organization's significant interest in wildlife and ecosystem conservation as well as local decision-making to preserve the community's uniquely picturesque natural landscapes." Mr. Kobus will answer questions on those limited subjects. Moreover, we will not agree to allow Mr. Kobus to respond to any questions regarding land use topics, as Judge Torem affirmatively identified Benton County as the lead for those issues. *Id.*, p. 5

We hope that we can agree to these limitations without the need to involve Judge Torem any more than necessary. Please confirm in writing that you will agree to limit your questions to the areas identified by the judge and we will work with you to get Mr. Kobus's deposition scheduled for next week. Absent your confirmation we do not intend to produce Mr. Kobus voluntarily – but of course we hope that it will not be necessary for us to refuse to produce him or to ask the judge to weigh in.

Additionally, as a housekeeping matter, please note that as we previously advised you, I'll be working with Tim McMahan and with the rest of the Horse Heaven team as litigation counsel. To that end, I'd appreciate it if you would include me on all correspondence going forward.

We look forward to your agreement to the approach we've outlined. Once we get your confirmation we'll firm up a date and time for Mr. Kobus's deposition.

Many thanks,

Willa Perlmutter | Of Counsel STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205 Direct: (503) 294-9462 | Mobile: (202) 441-0531 willa.perlmutter@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.



Begin forwarded message:

From: Rick Aramburu < Rick@aramburulaw.com>

Date: June 15, 2023 at 3:22:23 PM PDT

To: "McMahan, Tim" <tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>,

adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Aziza Foster <zfoster@mjbe.com>, "Dolloff, Julie K (ATG)"

<julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov>, Ethan Jones <Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org>,

Jessica Houston <<u>jessica@yakamanation-olc.org</u>>, Julie Kihn

< <u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>>, Ken Harper < <u>kharper@mjbe.com</u>>, "Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)" < <u>lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov</u>>, "Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)"

< sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov >, "Schimelpfenig, Emily K."

< <u>emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com</u>>, Shona Voelckers

<shona@yakamanation-olc.org>, "Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG)"

<jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>, "Stavitsky, Ariel H."

<ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Subject: Deposition of Dave Kobus

Mr. McMahan:

I write to reschedule the deposition of Mr. Kobus, who was unavailable for deposition on the previously noted date of June 5, 2023. I would like to take Mr. Kobus deposition on **10 am on June 22, 2023** in a virtual format, but I am also available to take his deposition on Friday, June 23. I will be asking him questions about the original and amended ASC.

In this email, I am only copying party representatives.

Should you have any questions, please contact me.

Rick Aramburu Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu

705 2nd Ave #1300

Seattle, Washington 98104 Telephone: (206) 625-9515

Email: rick@aramburu-eustis.com

This email may be protected by the Attorney-Client Privilege; if received in error, please discard and notify this office. Thank you.

From: McMahan, Tim < tim.mcmahan@stoel.com>

Sent: Tuesday, May 30, 2023 12:03 PM

To: adamtorem@writeme.com

Cc: Bumpus, Sonia (EFSEC) <<u>sonia.bumpus@efsec.wa.gov</u>>; Moon, Amy (EFSEC)

<amy.moon@efsec.wa.gov>; adjudication@efsec.wa.gov;

aramburulaw@gmail.com; Aziza Foster <zfoster@mjbe.com>; Dolloff, Julie K

(ATG) < julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov >; Ethan Jones < Ethan@yakamanation-olc.org >;

Jessica Houston <<u>jessica@yakamanation-olc.org</u>>; Julie Kihn <<u>Julie@mjbe.com</u>>;

Ken Harper < kharper@mjbe.com>; Masengale, Lisa (EFSEC)

< lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov >; Reyneveld, Sarah (ATG)

<sarah.reyneveld@atg.wa.gov>; Schimelpfenig, Emily K.

<emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com>; Shona Voelckers <shona@yakamanation-</pre>

olc.org>; Thompson, Jonathan C (ATG) < jonathan.thompson@atg.wa.gov>;

Stavitsky, Ariel H. <ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com>

Subject: Horse Heaven Wind Farm Docket #EF-210011; Response to TCC's

Demand for Deposition

Hello Judge Torem – Please find attached a letter responding to TCC regarding TCC's demand to take the deposition of Dave Kobus. Thank you for your attention to this matter. Best, TLM

Tim McMahan | Partner

STOEL RIVES LLP | 760 SW Ninth Ave, Suite 3000 | Portland, OR 97205

Direct: (503) 294-9517 | Mobile: (503) 504-8693

tim.mcmahan@stoel.com | Bio | vCard | www.stoel.com



This email may contain material that is confidential, privileged, and/or attorney work product for the sole use of the intended recipient. Any unauthorized review, use, or distribution is prohibited and may be unlawful.

28

BEFORE THE STATE OF WASHINGTON ENERGY FACILITY SITING EVALUATION COUNCIL

In the Matter of the Application of:

Scout Clean Energy, LLC, for Horse Heaven Wind Farm, LLC, Applicant. DOCKET NO. EF-210011

DECLARATION OF J. RICHARD ARAMBURU IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO COMPEL DEPOSITION

- I, J. Richard Aramburu, declare as follows:
- 1. I am over the age of eighteen years and competent to testify.
- 2. I am the attorney for Tri-Cities C.A.R.E.S., Intervenor in this proceeding.
- 3. Exhibit A to this declaration is an excerpt from a 2020 news article in a Portland, Indiana newspaper discussing project manager Dave Kobus and Scout's intention to add solar panels to their Benton County proposal.
- 4. Exhibit B is a portion of Scout's website describing Kobus and his role in the Horse Heaven proposed project:

 https://horseheavencleanenergy.com/meet-dave-kobus-senior-project-manager-with-ho
- rse-heaven-clean-energy-center/.

 5. Exhibit C is the May 26, 2023, TCC notice of deposition to Scout and
- 5. Exhibit C is the May 26, 2023, TCC notice of deposition to Scout and other parties in which the Kobus deposition was noted for June 5, 2023.

- 6. Exhibit D is a June 15, 2023 email of 2:42 PM responding to applicant's counsel, Ms. Perlmutter.
 - 7. Exhibit E is a June 16, 2023, 2:42 PM email responding to Ms. Perlmutter.
 - 8. Exhibit F is a June 18, 2023 3:42 PM email from Ms. Perlmutter.
- 9. Exhibit G is a June 23, 2023 email string that includes Mr. Aramburu's 2:46 PM response (page 1) to an 8:57 AM email from Ms. Perlmutter (page 2).
- 10. I have spent over 8 hours of time, responding to emails from the Applicant objecting to the deposition of Mr. Kobus, preparing this declaration and the Motion to Compel. My ordinary and reasonable fee herein is \$300 per hour, equalling \$2,400 for 8 hours of my professional time in responding to the improper objections to TCC's notice of deposition. TCC requests that ALJ Torem grant it \$2,400 in sanctions due to applicant's continuous lack of cooperation and adherence to issued rulings regarding discovery.

I declare under penalty of perjury of the laws of the State of Washington that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated this _25th ____ day of June, 2023, in Seattle, Washington.

J. Richard Aramburu, WSBA #466
Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu, PLLC
Attorney for Intervenor Tri-Cities C.A.R.E.S.

1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	BEFORE THE STATE OF WASHINGTON ENERGY FACILITY SITING EVALUATION COUNCIL
8	
9	In the Matter of the Application of: DOCKET NO. EF-210011
10	Scout Clean Energy, LLC, for Horse Heaven Wind Farm, LLC, DECLARATION OF SERVICE
11	Applicant.
12 13	
14	
15	I hereby certify that I have this day served TCC's PreFiled Testimony upon all
16	parties of record in this proceeding listed on the following page(s), by authorized
17	method of service pursuant to WAC 463-30-120(3), simultaneous with electronic filing
18	to adjudication@efsec.wa.gov and to email for parties as provided. Parties receiving by
19	first class mail only will be mailed their copies on June 26, 2023.
20	Dated at Seattle, Washington this <u>25th</u> day of <u>June</u> , 2023.
21	
22	<u>/s/</u> Carol Cohoe, Legal Assistant Law Offices of J. Richard Aramburu, PLLC
23	Law Offices of J. Řichard Aramburu, PLLC
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	LAW OFFICES OF J. RICHARD ARAMBURU. PLLC

1 PARTIES OF RECORD 2 Kenneth Harper, Aziza Foster sonia.bumpus@efsec.wa.gov Menke Jackson Beyer, LLP 807 North 39th Avenue 3 Washington State Department of Yakima WA 98902 Agriculture 4 By Email: kharper@mjbe.com; Natural Resources Building, 2nd Floor zfoster@mjbe.com; Julie@mjbe.com P.O. Box 42560 5 1111 Washington St. SE Olympia, WA 98504-2560 Ryan Brown Chief Deputy Prosecuting Attorney 6 Benton County Prosecuting Attorney Washington State Department of 7 7211 West Okanogan Place, Building A Commerce Kennewick, WA 99336 1011 Plum Street SE 8 Counsel for Benton County P.O. Box 42525 Olympia, WA 98504-2525 By Email: Ryan.Brown@co.benton.wa.us 9 Washington State Department of 10 Sarah Reyneveld Ecology Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 47600 11 800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000 Olympia, WA 98504-7600 Seattle, WA 98104-3188 12 Counsel for the Environment Washington State Department of Fish By Email: and Wildlife 13 Sarah.Reyneveld@atg.wa.gov Natural Resources Building CEPSeaEF@atg.wa.gov; 1111 Washington St. SE Olympia, WA 98501 14 julie.dolloff@atg.wa.gov 15 Tim McMahan Washington State Department of Stoel Rives LLP Natural Resources 16 760 SW Ninth Avenue, Suite 3000 Natural Resources Building Portland, OR 97205 MS 47000, Olympia, WA 98504 1111 Washington St. SE 17 Counsel for Scout Clean Energy, LLC By Email: tim.mcmahan@stoel.com Olympia, WA 98504 emily.schimelpfenig@stoel.com; 18 ariel.stavitsky@stoel.com; Washington State Utilities and 19 willa.perlmutter@stoel.com; Transportation Commission MAILSTOP/PO BOX: 431 20 Shona Voelckers (621 Woodland Sq Loop SE) Lacey, WA 98503-0361 Yakama Nation 21 shona@yakamanation-olc.org ethan@yakamanation-olc.org 22 jessica@yakamanation-olc.org Original mailed to: 23 **EFSEC ALJ Adam Torem** Energy Facility Site Evaluation Council ATTŇ: Horse Heaven Adjudication 24 adamtorem@writeme.com Mailstop 43172 25 **EFSEC Staff** Olympia, WA 98504-3172 lisa.masengale@efsec.wa.gov; 26 alex.shiley@efsec.wa.gov; andrea.grantham@efsec.wa.gov; 27

28